

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE  
WESTERN DIVISION**

<b>CECILIA SANTOS, JOSE FRANCISCO</b>	)	
<b>CALDERON, ERLINDA FRANCO, AND</b>	)	
<b>DANIEL ALVARADO,</b>	)	
	)	<b>No. 03-2932 M1/P</b>
<b>Plaintiffs,</b>	)	
	)	<b>JURY TRIAL</b>
<b>v.</b>	)	
	)	<b>JUDGE McCALLA</b>
<b>NICOLAS CARRANZA,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>Defendant.</b>	)	

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR  
JUDGMENT NOTWITHSTANDING THE VERDICT,  
NEW TRIAL, AND/OR REMITTITUR**

On November 18, 2005, nine jurors found Defendant Nicolas Carranza liable to the four plaintiffs remaining in this case on claims of torture, extrajudicial killing, and crimes against humanity. Now, in his Motion for Judgment Notwithstanding the Verdict, New Trial, and/or Remittitur (hereinafter, the "Motion"), the defendant seeks to avoid those jurors' verdict. As discussed more fully in the memorandum filed in support of this Opposition, none of the defendant's arguments provide any basis for the relief he seeks. Indeed, the majority of the defendant's arguments are simply restatements of assertions already rejected by this Court. Because of this, and because none of the defendant's arguments provide the basis for a judgment notwithstanding the verdict, a new trial, or remittitur, the defendant's Motion should be denied.

Dated: February 17, 2006

Respectfully submitted,

/s David R. Esquivel

David R. Esquivel (TN Bar No. 21459)  
BASS, BERRY & SIMS PLC  
315 Deaderick Street, Suite 2700  
Nashville, TN 37238-3001  
Tel: (615) 742-6200  
Fax: (615) 742-0405

Matthew J. Eisenbrandt (CA Bar No. 217335)  
CENTER FOR JUSTICE & ACCOUNTABILITY  
870 Market Street, Suite 684  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Tel: (415) 544-0444  
Fax: (415) 544-0456

Carolyn Patty Blum (MA Bar No. 046880)  
CENTER FOR JUSTICE & ACCOUNTABILITY  
291 West 12th Street  
New York, NY 10014  
Tel: (212) 989-0012  
Fax: (415) 544-0456

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has this day been served upon the following counsel for the Defendant by electronic means via the court's electronic filing system this 17th day of February, 2006.

Robert M. Fargarson, Esq.  
Fargarson & Brooke  
P.O. Box 3543  
Memphis, TN 38173-0543

*Counsel for Defendant Nicolas Carranza*

s/David R. Esquivel